

Appellant alleges that Wicks and Ogot teach away from one another and that one skilled in the art would not be motivated to substitute the Ogot narrow band circular disk ground plane for the Wicks broadband ground plane.

It would have been an obvious matter of design choice to have the symmetrical ground plane is disk shaped, since such a modification would have involved a mere change in the shape of the symmetrical ground plane. A change in shape is generally recognized as being within the level ordinary skill in the art (See MPEP 2144.04 IV B).

For the above reasons, it is believed that the rejections should be sustained.

Respectfully submitted,
Shih-Chao Chen
Shih-Chao Chen
Primary Examiner
Art Unit 2821

SXC
July 28, 2004

Conferees
Chaudhuri Olik
Don Wong
Shih-Chao Chen
July 20, 2004

For Olik Don Wong
Don Wong
Shih-Chao Chen

Docket Administrator (Room 3J-219)
Lucent Technologies Inc.
101 Crawfords Corner Road
Holmdel, NJ 07733-3030